

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF
NEW YORK

Sarah Bell v. Maguire Chrysler LLC and Gabriel Rugiero

No. 3:23-CV-1008 (AJB/ML), United States District Court for the Northern District of New York (December 8, 2025)

SUMMARY

The United States District Court for the Northern District of New York granted Maguire Chrysler LLC's motion for summary judgment on the plaintiff's FLSA, NYLL, and negligent supervision and retention claims. The court declined to exercise supplemental jurisdiction over the remaining NYSHRL and state-law claims, dismissed those claims without prejudice to renewal in state court, and vacated the entry of default against Gabriel Rugiero. The court directed the Clerk to enter judgment and close the case.

CASE DETAILS

COURT	United States District Court for the Northern District of New York
WRITING FOR THE COURT	Anthony J. Brindisi
JURISDICTION	United States District Court for the Northern District of New York
DECIDED	December 8, 2025
DOCKET	3:23-CV-1008 (AJB/ML)
DISPOSITION	dismissed
PROCEDURAL POSTURE	Plaintiff brought claims under the Fair Labor Standards Act, New York Labor Law, New York State Human Rights Law, and state tort law. Maguire Chrysler moved for summary judgment on all claims. Rugiero had previously defaulted, and the court had entered a partial default judgment as to liability. The court granted summary judgment in part, declined supplemental jurisdiction over the remaining state-law claims, vacated the entry of default against Rugiero, and dismissed the remaining claims without prejudice to renewal in state court.
STANDARD OF REVIEW	Summary judgment is appropriate when the movant shows that there is no genuine dispute as to any material fact and that the movant is entitled to judgment as a matter of law. The court views the facts and draws reasonable inferences in favor of the nonmoving party, but there is no genuine issue when the record as a whole could not lead a rational trier of fact to find for that party.

PRECEDENTIAL VALUE	Unknown
PARTIES	Sarah Bell v. Maguire Chrysler LLC, Gabriel Rugiero

TOPICS

summary judgment flsa sexual harassment hostile work environment civil procedure

PRACTICE AREAS

employment law civil procedure civil rights torts

QUESTIONS PRESENTED

1. Whether Bell's express abandonment of her FLSA claim warranted dismissal of that claim.
2. Whether the court should grant summary judgment on or otherwise dismiss Bell's abandoned NYLL and negligent supervision and retention claims.
3. Whether the court should decline supplemental jurisdiction over Bell's remaining NYSHRL claims after dismissal of the sole federal claim.
4. Whether the court should decline supplemental jurisdiction over the state-law claims against Rugiero and vacate the prior entry of default after the federal claim was dismissed.

HOLDINGS

1. Because Bell expressly abandoned her FLSA overtime claim in opposition to summary judgment, the claim was dismissed.
2. Bell's NYLL unpaid-overtime claim and negligent supervision and retention claim were dismissed after Bell abandoned them in her opposition papers.
3. The court declined to exercise supplemental jurisdiction over Bell's remaining NYSHRL claims after dismissing the sole federal claim and dismissed those claims without prejudice to renewal in state court.
4. The court declined supplemental jurisdiction over the state-law claims against Rugiero and vacated the entry of default because the sole federal claim had been dismissed and the prior liability determination was not a final judgment.

KEY QUOTATIONS

“The entry of summary judgment is appropriate if “the movant shows that there is no genuine dispute as to any material fact and the movant is entitled to judgment as a matter of law.”” (III)

“In all, the balance of the factors counsels in favor of declining to exercise supplemental jurisdiction over plaintiff’s NYSHRL claims.” (IV.B)

“Plaintiff’s remaining claims are DISMISSED as to all defendants, without prejudice to renewal in state court.” (V)

FACTUAL BACKGROUND

Bell worked as a parts advisor for Maguire Chrysler beginning in June 2022. She reported that coworker Gabriel Rugiero sexually harassed her, and the company investigated the complaint and terminated Rugiero. Bell was later warned and placed on probation for alleged performance and policy violations, and Maguire Chrysler terminated her on February 17, 2023. Bell disputed the stated performance rationale and alleged discrimination, retaliation, wage violations, and related torts.

PROCEDURAL HISTORY

Bell filed the action on August 17, 2023. Rugiero failed to answer, the Clerk entered default, and the court later entered a partial default judgment as to liability while staying damages proceedings. Maguire Chrysler then moved for summary judgment. After Bell abandoned her FLSA, NYLL, and negligent supervision and retention claims, the court dismissed the FLSA claim, declined supplemental jurisdiction over the remaining NYSHRL claims against both defendants, vacated the entry of default against Rugiero, and closed the case.

DISPOSITION

dismissed

REMAND INSTRUCTIONS

No remand was ordered. The remaining state-law claims were dismissed without prejudice to renewal in state court; the entry of default against Rugiero was vacated.

CASES CITED

- Jackson v. Fed. Exp., 766 F.3d 189, 196 (2d Cir. 2014)
- Anderson v. Liberty Lobby, Inc., 477 U.S. 242, 248, 255 (1986)
- Matsushita Elec. Indus. Co. v. Zenith Radio Corp., 475 U.S. 574, 588 (1986)
- Pension Ben. Guar. Corp. ex rel. St. Vincent Catholic Med. Ctrs. Ret. Plan v. Morgan Stanley Inv. Mgmt. Inc., 712 F.3d 705, 727 (2d Cir. 2013)
- Chinniah v. Fed. Energy Regul. Comm'n, 62 F.4th 700, 703 (2d Cir. 2023)
- Gorman v. Covidien, LLC, 146 F. Supp. 3d 509, 521 (S.D.N.Y. 2015)
- Baguidy v. Boro Transit Inc., 283 F. Supp. 3d 14, 33 (E.D.N.Y. 2017)
- Wright v. White Plains Hosp. Med. Ctr., 237 A.D.3d 1143, 1145 (2d Dep't 2025)
- Syeed v. Bloomberg L.P., 235 N.E.3d 351, 354 (N.Y. 2024)
- Cobb v. Ellab Inc., 2024 WL 1963430, at *5 (N.D.N.Y. May 2, 2024)
- Stidhum v. 161-10 Hillside Auto Ave, LLC, 2025 WL 327973, at *11 (E.D.N.Y. Jan. 29, 2025)
- Green v. Gen. Motors, 2023 WL 3541265, at *8 (W.D.N.Y. May 18, 2023)
- Fitzgerald v. We Co., 2022 WL 952963, at *10 (S.D.N.Y. Mar. 30, 2022)
- Murray v. Visiting Nurse Services of N.Y., 528 F. Supp. 2d 257, 280–81 (S.D.N.Y. 2007)

- Norman v. NYU Langone Health System, 492 F. Supp. 3d 154, 168–69 (S.D.N.Y. 2020), aff'd, 2021 WL 5986999 (2d Cir. Dec. 17, 2021)
- Henry v. Oluwole, 108 F.4th 45, 51 (2d Cir. 2024)
- Swarna v. Al-Awadi, 622 F.3d 123, 140 (2d Cir. 2010)
- Enron Oil Corp. v. Diakuhara, 10 F.3d 90, 95 (2d Cir. 1993)
- 287 Franklin Ave. Residents' Ass'n v. Meisels, 2016 WL 8711083, at *2 (E.D.N.Y. Sept. 30, 2016)
- Lozada v. Haitech Works LLC, 2025 WL 2912659 (N.D.N.Y. Oct. 14, 2025)
- Mohnkern v. Equifax Info. Services, LLC, 2021 WL 5239902 (W.D.N.Y. Nov. 10, 2021)

Retrieved from lawtools.ai · <https://lawtools.ai/cases/federal/united-states-district-court-for-the-northern-district-of-ne/2025/sarah-bell-v-maguire-chrysler-llc-and-gabriel-rugiero-0qv8s240>