

**SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK, APPELLATE DIVISION,  
FIRST DEPARTMENT**

**Applehole v Wyeth Ayerst Labs.**

Applehole v. Wyeth Ayerst Labs., 2023 NY Slip Op 01059 (App. Div. 2023) · No. Appeal No. 17418; Case No. 2022-00788; Index No. 105122/09 · Decided February 28, 2023

---

**SUMMARY**

The Appellate Division, First Department dismissed an appeal challenging the disqualification of Parker Waichman LLP from representing intervenor plaintiffs. The court held that the prior disqualification ruling was law of the case and that Parker Waichman lacked standing to appeal because it had already been disqualified from representing the plaintiffs.

**OPINION**

**PER CURIAM.**

Applehole v Wyeth Ayerst Labs. (2023 NY Slip Op 01059) Applehole v Wyeth Ayerst Labs. 2023 NY Slip Op 01059 Decided on February 28, 2023 Appellate Division, First Department Published by New York State Law Reporting Bureau pursuant to Judiciary Law § 431. This opinion is uncorrected and subject to revision before publication in the Official Reports. Decided and Entered: February 28, 2023 Before: Kern, J.P., Oing, Kennedy, Mendez, Pitt-Burke, JJ. Index No. 105122/09 Appeal No. 17418 Case No. 2022-00788 [\*1]Clara Applehole et al., Plaintiff-Appellants, vWyeth Ayerst Laboratories et al, Defendants, Paul Napoli et al., Defendants-Respondents.

[And Another Action] Parker Waichman LLP, Port Washington (Jay L. T. Breakstone of counsel), for appellants. L'Abbate, Balkan, Colavita & Contini, LLP, Melville (Marian C. Rice of counsel), for Paul J. Napoli, Napoli, Kaiser & Associates LLP, Napoli Kaiser, Bern LLP, Napoli, Kaiser, Bern & Associates, LLP and Napoli, Kaiser & Bern, P.C., Groombridge, Wu, Baughman and Stone, LLP, New York (Eric Alan Stone of counsel), for Paul J. Napoli, Napoli, Kaiser & Associates LLP, Napoli Kaiser, Bern LLP, Napoli, Kaiser, Bern & Associates, LLP and Napoli, Kaiser & Bern, P.C.

Ropers Majeski, P.C., New York (John W. Hanson of counsel), for Marc J. Bern and Law Office of Marc J Bern, and Godosky & Gentile, P.C., New York (Anthony Gentile of counsel), for Gerald Kaiser, respondents. Appeal from order, Supreme Court, New York County (Andrew Borrok, J.), entered January 31, 2022, which granted the motion of defendants Paul J. Napoli, Gerald Kaiser, Marc J. Bern, Napoli, Kaiser & Associates LLP, Napoli, Kaiser, Bern LLP, Napoli, Kaiser, Bern & Associates LLP, Law Offices of Marc Jay Bern, P.C., Napoli, Kaiser, Bern & Associates P.C., and

Napoli, Kaiser & Bern, P.C. to disqualify Parker Waichman LLP or any of its related entities from representing intervenor plaintiffs in this action, unanimously dismissed, without costs.

Plaintiffs have already appealed a prior order determining that Parker Waichman was disqualified under Rules of Professional Conduct (22 NYCRR 1200.0) rule 3.7(b) from representing intervenor plaintiffs in this action, as a partner of that firm was to be called as a material witness. This Court affirmed the order, and both this Court and the Court of Appeals denied leave to appeal (see *Matter of Diet Drug Litig.*, 180 AD3d 483, 483 [1st Dept 2020], lv denied 36 NY3d 942 [2020]).

As a result, since there has been no new evidence discovered after the prior order or any change in the applicable law, resolution of the issue on the prior appeal constitutes the law of the case and forecloses reexamination of the issue (see *Kenney v City of New York*, 74 AD3d 630, 630-631 [1st Dept 2010]).

As Parker Waichman was disqualified from representing plaintiffs in any capacity, it does not have standing to bring the appeal and therefore, the appeal must be dismissed. THIS CONSTITUTES THE DECISION AND ORDER OF THE SUPREME COURT, APPELLATE DIVISION, FIRST DEPARTMENT. ENTERED: February 28, 2023