

UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS FOR THE NINTH CIRCUIT

Stoltie v. Tilton

Stoltie · No. 07-56079 · Decided August 18, 2008

OPINION

Stoltie v. Tilton

PER CURIAM.

FOR PUBLICATION

UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS

FOR THE NINTH CIRCUIT

BRIAN JOSEPH STOLTIE,

Petitioner-Appellee, No. 07-56079 v. D.C. No.

CV-06-00289-DDP

JAMES E. TILTON, Secretary of the Department of Corrections, OPINION Respondent-Appellant. Appeal from the United States District Court for the Central District of California Dean D. Pregerson, District Judge, Presiding Argued and Submitted August 6, 2008—Pasadena, California Filed August 19, 2008 Before: Stephen Reinhardt, Circuit Judge, Roger J. Miner,* Senior Circuit Judge and Marsha S. Berzon, Circuit Judge. Per Curiam Opinion *The Honorable Roger J. Miner, Senior United States Circuit Judge for the Second Circuit, sitting by designation. 11025

11026 STOLTIE v. TILTON

COUNSEL

Jonathan Libby, Deputy Federal Public Defender, Los Angeles, California, for the petitioner-appellee. Heather F. Crawford, Deputy Attorney General for the State of California, San Diego, California, for the respondent-appellant.

OPINION

PER CURIAM: We AFFIRM the district court's decision, and adopt its opinion in *Stoltie v. California*, reported at 501 F. Supp. 2d 1252 (C.D. Cal. 2007), except for Section III.C., as to which we express no view. As the state acknowledged at oral argument, even the state appellate court misunderstood the confused and confusing explanation of reasonable doubt provided to the jury by the trial judge. This error led it to apply in an unreasonable manner clearly established Supreme Court law regarding reasonable doubt. *Sullivan v. Louisiana*, 508 U.S. 275 (1993); *Cage v. Louisiana*, 498 U.S. 39 (1990), overruled on other grounds by *Estelle v. McGuire*, 502 U.S. 62 (1991); *In re Winship*, 397 U.S. 358 (1970). AFFIRMED.

PRINTED FOR

ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICE—U.S. COURTS

The summary, which does not constitute a part of the opinion of the court, is copyrighted

Retrieved from lawtools.ai · <https://lawtools.ai/cases/federal/ninth-circuit/2008/stoltie-v-tilton-1xts76sj>