

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE CENTRAL DISTRICT OF
CALIFORNIA

Schatz v. Live Auctioneers, LLC

Schatz · No. 2:24-cv-09963-MWF-RAO · Decided August 27, 2025

OPINION

Schatz v. Live Auctioneers, LLC

PER CURIAM.

| Stephen M. Doniger, Esq. (SBN 179314) 2 || stephen@donigerlawfirm.com David Shein (SBN 230870) 3 david@donigerlawfirm.com

4 || DONIGER / BURROUGHS

603 Rose Avenue 5 Venice, California 90291 6 || Telephone: (310) 590-1820 7 Attorneys for Plaintiffs 8

9 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

10 CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

1] 12 HOWARD SCHATZ, an individual; Case No. 2:24-cv-09963-MWF-RAO 3 BEVERLY ORNSTEIN, an individual | Hon. Rozella A. Oliver Presiding 14 || Plaintiffs,

15 STIPULATED PROTECTIVE

ORDER!

16 VS. 17

12 LIVE AUCTIONEERS, LLC, a New

York Limited Liability Company, doing 19 business as “JASPER 52;” and DOES I- 20 10, inclusive, 21 Defendants 22 23 24 25 26 27 9g || | This Stipulated Protective Order is substantially based on the model protective order provided under Magistrate Judge Rozella A. Oliver’s Procedures.

Vly, A. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

2 Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential, 3 proprietary or private information for which special protection from public 4 || disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may > || be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to 6 || enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this 7 || Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to 8 discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends ? only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment 10 | under the applicable legal principles.

B. GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT

12 This action is likely to involve customer and pricing lists and other valuable 13 research,

development, commercial, financial, technical, and/or proprietary 14 | information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for 15 any purpose other than prosecution of this action is warranted. Such confidential 16 | and proprietary materials and information consist of, among other things, || confidential business or financial information, information regarding confidential 18 |) business practices, or other confidential research, development, or commercial 19 || information (including information implicating privacy rights of third parties), 20 || information otherwise generally unavailable to the public, or which may be 21 privileged or otherwise protected from disclosure under state or federal statutes, 22 || court rules, case decisions, or common law. Accordingly, to expedite the flow of 23 || information, to facilitate the prompt resolution of disputes over confidentiality of 24 discovery materials, to adequately protect information the parties are entitled to keep confidential, to ensure that the parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses of 26 || such material in preparation for and in the conduct of trial, to address their handling 27 |! at the end of the litigation, and serve the ends of justice, a protective order for such 28 1 || information is justified in this matter. It is the intent of the parties that information 2 || will not be designated as confidential for tactical reasons and that nothing be so 3 designated without a good faith belief that it has been maintained in a confidential, 4 non-public manner, and there is good cause why it should not be part of the public > || record of this case.

6 C. ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF PROCEDURE FOR FILING UNDER SEAL

7 The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section 12.3, below, that this 8 Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential information ? || under seal; Local Civil Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures that must be followed 10 || and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court 11 to file material under seal.

12 There is a strong presumption that the public has a right of access to judicial 13 proceedings and records in civil cases. In connection with non-dispositive motions, 14 good cause must be shown to support a filing under seal. See *Kamakana v. City and County of Honolulu*, 447 F.3d 1172, 1176 (9th Cir. 2006); *Phillips v. Gen. Motors Corp.*, 307 F.3d 1206, 1210-11 (9th Cir. 2002); *Makar-Welbon v. Sony Electronics, Inc.*, 187 F.R.D. 576, 577 (E.D. Wis. 1999) (even stipulated protective orders 18 require good cause showing), and a specific showing of good cause or compelling 19 reasons with proper evidentiary support and legal justification, must be made with 20 respect to Protected Material that a party seeks to file under seal. The parties' mere 21 designation of Disclosure or Discovery Material as CONFIDENTIAL does not— 22 || without the submission of competent evidence by declaration, establishing that the 23 || material sought to be filed under seal qualifies as confidential, privileged, or 24 || otherwise protectable—constitute good cause. 25 Further, if a party requests sealing related to a dispositive motion or trial, then 26 compelling reasons, not only good cause, for the sealing must be shown, and the 27 || relief sought shall be narrowly tailored to serve the specific interest to be protected. 28 ! || See *Pintos v. Pacific Creditors Ass'n*, 605 F.3d 665, 677-79 (9th Cir. 2010). For 2 || each item or type of information, document, or thing sought to be filed or introduced 3 || under

seal in connection with a dispositive motion or trial, the party seeking 4 protection must articulate compelling reasons, supported by specific facts and legal 5 justification, for the requested sealing order. Again, competent evidence supporting 6 || the application to file documents under seal must be provided by declaration. 7 Any document that is not confidential, privileged, or otherwise protectable in 8 its entirety will not be filed under seal if the confidential portions can be redacted. ? || If documents can be redacted, then a redacted version for public viewing, omitting 10 only the confidential, privileged, or otherwise protectable portions of the document 11 shall be filed. Any application that seeks to file documents under seal in their 12 entirety should include an explanation of why redaction is not feasible.

132. DEFINITIONS

14 2.1 Action: This pending federal lawsuit Howard Schatz, et al.,v. Live 15 Auctioneers, LLC, et al., Case No.: CV 24-9963-MWF-RAO. 16 2.2 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the 7 designation of information or items under this Order. 18 2.3 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of 19 | how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for 20 protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in 21 || the Good Cause Statement. 22 2.4 Counsel: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as 23 | their support staff). 24 2.5 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or 25 || items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as

26 || “CONFIDENTIAL.”

27 2.6 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless 28 1 || of the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including, 2 among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things) that are produced or 3 generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter. 4 2.7 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter 5 pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as 6 || an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action. 7 2.8 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this Action. 8 || House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside ? |! counsel. 10 2.9 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association or 1} other legal entity not named as a Party to this action. 12 2.10 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a 13 party to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and 14 || have appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm 13 |! that has appeared on behalf of that party, and includes support staff. 16 2.11 Party: any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors, V7 employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their 18 support staffs). 19 2.12 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or 20 Discovery Material in this Action. 21 2.13 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation 22 support services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or 23 || demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium) 24 |) and

their employees and subcontractors. 25 2.14 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is 26 || designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” 27 2.15 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery 28 ! || Material from a Producing Party.

* || 3. SCOPE

3 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only 4 || Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or 5 extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or 6 compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or 7 presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material. 8 Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders of the ? |) trial judge. This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

10 || 4. | DURATION

Once a case proceeds to trial, information that was designated as 12 || CONFIDENTIAL or maintained pursuant to this protective order used or introduced || as an exhibit at trial becomes public and will be presumptively available to all 14 || members of the public, including the press, unless compelling reasons supported by 15 specific factual findings to proceed otherwise are made to the trial judge in advance 16 of the trial. See *Kamakana*, 447 F.3d at 1180-81 (distinguishing “good cause” 7 showing for sealing documents produced in discovery from “compelling reasons” 18 || standard when merits-related documents are part of court record). Accordingly, the 19 |! terms of this protective order do not extend beyond the commencement of the trial.

20 5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

21 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection. 22 || Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under 23 || this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that 24 qualifies under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for 25 protection only those parts of material, documents, items or oral or written 26 || communications that qualify so that other portions of the material, documents, items 27 || or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably 28 ! || within the ambit of this Order. 2 Mass, indiscriminate or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations 3 || that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper 4 purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to impose 5 unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Designating 6 Party to sanctions. 7 If it comes to a Designating Party’s attention that information or items that it 8 designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must ? promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation. 10 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in 11 this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise 12 stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection || under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or 14 produced. 15 Designation in conformity with this Order requires: 16 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic 17 || documents, but

excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing Party affix at a minimum, the legend “CONFIDENTIAL” (hereinafter “CONFIDENTIAL legend”), to each page that contains protected material. If only a portion of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins). A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for inspection need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated which documents it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be deemed “CONFIDENTIAL.” After the inspecting Party has identified the documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the “CONFIDENTIAL legend” to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a portion of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins). (b) for testimony given in depositions that the Designating Party identifies the Disclosure or Discovery Material on the record, before the close of the deposition all protected testimony. (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information is stored the legend “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a portion or portions of the information warrants protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).

5.3. Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the Designating Party’s right to secure protection under this Order for such material. Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this Order.

6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court’s Scheduling Order.

6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute resolution process under Local Rule 37.1 et seq.

6.3 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating Party has waived or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all parties shall continue to afford the material in question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party’s designation until the Court rules on the challenge.

7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is 12 |! disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this 13 Action only for prosecuting, defending or attempting to settle this Action. Such 14 || Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the I> |) conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a 16 Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL 17 || DISPOSITION). 18 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a 19 || location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons 20 || authorized under this Order, 21 7.2 Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items. Unless 22 || otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a 23 Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated 24 || "CONFIDENTIAL" only to: 25 (a) the Receiving Party's Outside Counsel of Record in this Action, as 26 || well as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably 27 necessary to disclose the information for this Action; 28 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of 2 || the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and 3 || if the Receiving Party is an individual, then to the individual; 4 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom > || disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the 6 "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A); 7 (d) the court and its personnel; 8 (e) court reporters and their staff; ? (f) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional 10 || Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A); 12 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a || custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information; 14 (h) during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses, in the 13 || Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (1) the deposing party 16 requests that the witness sign the form attached as Exhibit A hereto; and (2) they 17 || will not be permitted to keep any confidential information unless they sign the 18 "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A), unless otherwise 19 agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed 20 deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material may 21 || be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except 22 || as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order; and 23 (1) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel, 24 mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.

25 || 8, PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED 26 IN OTHER LITIGATION

2] If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation 28 1 that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as 2 || "CONFIDENTIAL," that Party must: 3 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification 4 || shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order; 5 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who

caused the subpoena or order © || to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the 7 subpoena or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include 8 a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and ? (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be 10 pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected. If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with 12 the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this | action as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which the 14 subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s I5 permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking 16 protection in that court of its confidential material and nothing in these provisions 17 || should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action 18 to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

1 | 9, A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE

20 PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION

21 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a 22 Non-Party in this Action and designated by the Non-Party a Party or as 23 || “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such information produced by Non-Parties in connection with 24 || this litigation is protected by the remedies and relief provided by this Order. 25 Nothing in these provisions should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from 26 seeking additional protections. 27 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to 28 produce a Non-Party’s confidential information in its possession, and the Party is 2 subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party’s 3 || confidential information, then the Party shall: 4 (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party > || that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality 6 agreement with a Non-Party; 7 (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated 8 || Protective Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably ? specific description of the information requested; and 10 (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-Party, if requested. 12 (c) If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this court within 3 || 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party 14 may produce the Non-Party’s confidential information responsive to the discovery I5 request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall 16 | not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to the 7 confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court. 18 || Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and 19 expense of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

20 || 10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

21 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed 22 || Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this 23 Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in 24 writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts 25 to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the

Protected Material, (c) inform the person or 26 persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order, 27 |) and (d) request such person or persons to execute the “Acknowledgment and 28 Agreement to Be Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

2 11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE

3 PROTECTED MATERIAL

4 When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain 5 inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, 6 || the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil 7 || Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever 8 procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production ? || without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and 10 (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a 11 |) communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work 12 product protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated 13 protective order submitted to the court.

14 12. MISCELLANEOUS

15 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any 16 person to seek its modification by the Court in the future. V7 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this 18 || Protective Order, no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to 19 disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this 20 Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any 21 ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order. 22 12.3 Filing Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any 23 || Protected Material must comply with Local Civil Rule 79-5. Protected Material 24 may only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the 25 specific Protected Material at issue. If a Party’s request to file Protected Material 26 || under seal is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information 27 || in the public record unless otherwise instructed by the court. 28

| 13. FINAL DISPOSITION

2 After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in paragraph 4, within 60 3 days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must return 4 || all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in 5 this subdivision, “all Protected Material” includes all copies, abstracts, compilations, © || summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected 7 || Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving 8 Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same ? person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies 10 (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies, 12 |! abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any 13 | of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to 14 |! retain an archival copy of

all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in Section 4 (DURATION).

14. VIOLATION

Any violation of this Order may be punished by appropriate measures including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or monetary sanctions. IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD. Dated: August 26, 2025 By: /s/David Shein Stephen M. Doniger David Shein

DONIGER / BURROUGHS

Attorneys for Plaintiff Dated: August 26, 2025 By: /s/ Steven P. Mandell Steven P. Mandell Attorneys for Defendants The filer attests that all signatories listed, and on whose behalf this filing is submitted, concur in this filing's content and have authorized its filing.

FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, THE JOINT MOTION FOR STIPULATED

PROTECTIVE ORDER IS GRANTED AND IT IS SO ORDERED. DATED: August 27, 2025 Raped In a, OC. Hon. Kozella A. Oliver United States Magistrate Judge

EXHIBIT A

2 ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, [full name], of [full address], declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the United States District Court for the Central District of California on [date] in the case of Howard Schatz, et al. v. Live Auctioneers, LLC, et al., Case No. CV 24-9963-MWF(RAOx). I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order. I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the Central District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this action. I hereby appoint [full name] of [full address and telephone number] as my California agent for service of process in connection with this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective Order. Date: City and State where signed: Printed name: Signature: