

SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK, APPELLATE DIVISION,  
FIRST DEPARTMENT

Fields v. Junius-Liberty Dev. LLC

Fields, 2026 NY Slip Op 01401 (Supreme Court of the State of New York Appellate Division First Department 2026) · No. Index No. 808496/22; Appeal No. 6066; Case No. 2025-02246 · Decided March 12, 2026

SUMMARY

The Appellate Division, First Department unanimously affirmed an order granting the plaintiff summary judgment on liability under Labor Law §§ 240(1) and 241(6). The court held that the plaintiff established a violation of Labor Law § 240(1) by showing that he fell from an unsecured ladder while performing construction-related repair work, and that the defendant failed to raise a triable issue regarding routine maintenance, sole proximate cause, or comparative negligence.

CASE DETAILS

|                       |                                                                                                                                                                   |
|-----------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| COURT                 | Supreme Court of the State of New York, Appellate Division, First Department                                                                                      |
| WRITING FOR THE COURT | Kennedy, J.P.; Gesmer, J.; Mendez, J.; Pitt-Burke, J.; Rosado, J.                                                                                                 |
| JURISDICTION          | New York Supreme Court, Appellate Division, First Department                                                                                                      |
| DECIDED               | March 12, 2026                                                                                                                                                    |
| DOCKET                | Index No. 808496/22; Appeal No. 6066; Case No. 2025-02246                                                                                                         |
| DISPOSITION           | affirmed                                                                                                                                                          |
| PROCEDURAL POSTURE    | Plaintiff moved for summary judgment on liability under Labor Law §§ 240(1) and 241(6). Supreme Court, Bronx County, granted the motion, and defendant appealed.  |
| STANDARD OF REVIEW    | Summary judgment is proper where the movant establishes entitlement to judgment as a matter of law and the opposing party fails to raise a triable issue of fact. |
| PRECEDENTIAL VALUE    | Published appellate decision                                                                                                                                      |
| PARTIES               | Junius-Liberty Development LLC v. Randy Fields                                                                                                                    |

TOPICS

- construction law
- appellate procedure
- standard of review

## PRACTICE AREAS

construction law

personal injury

New York Labor Law

## QUESTIONS PRESENTED

1. Whether plaintiff established prima facie entitlement to summary judgment on liability under Labor Law § 240(1) by showing that defendant failed to provide adequate safety devices.
2. Whether plaintiff's repair work constituted mere routine maintenance outside the protections of the Labor Law.
3. Whether defendant raised a triable issue of fact as to plaintiff's status as the sole proximate cause of his injuries.
4. Whether plaintiff's alleged comparative negligence or conduct in touching a hot pipe defeated his Labor Law § 240(1) claim.
5. Whether defendant's arguments concerning Labor Law § 241(6) required reversal when summary judgment under Labor Law § 240(1) was properly granted.

## HOLDINGS

1. Plaintiff established prima facie entitlement to summary judgment by showing that defendant failed to supply adequate safety devices to protect him from falling from the ladder.
2. Defendant failed to raise a triable issue of fact that plaintiff was engaged in mere routine maintenance; plaintiff's repair of a ceiling leak was work protected by the Labor Law.
3. Defendant failed to raise a triable issue of fact that plaintiff was the sole proximate cause of his injuries.
4. Comparative negligence is not a defense to a Labor Law § 240(1) claim.
5. Defendant's arguments concerning the Labor Law § 241(6) claim were academic because summary judgment on the Labor Law § 240(1) claim was properly granted.

## KEY QUOTATIONS

*“Plaintiff established prima facie entitlement to summary judgment on his Labor Law § 240(1) claim by showing that defendant failed to supply him with safety devices adequate to protect him from falling”*

*“comparative negligence is not a defense to a Labor Law § 240(1) claim”*

## FACTUAL BACKGROUND

Plaintiff was performing repair work at a construction site, including repairing a ceiling leak by cutting into the ceiling with a sheet-rock knife and an electric saw. While standing on an unsecured ladder, the ladder gave way and plaintiff fell to the ground. Defendant argued that plaintiff was engaged in routine maintenance, that he was the sole proximate cause of the accident, and that emergency-room records showed he caused the ladder to shake after touching a hot pipe.

## PROCEDURAL HISTORY

The Supreme Court, Bronx County, granted plaintiff's motion for partial summary judgment on liability under Labor Law §§ 240(1) and 241(6). The Appellate Division, First Department, unanimously affirmed the order.

#### DISPOSITION

affirmed

#### CASES CITED

- Begnoja v. Hudson Riv. Park Trust, 238 A.D.3d 481, 481 (1st Dep't 2025)
- Daniello v. J.T. Magen & Co. Inc., 239 A.D.3d 516, 517 (1st Dep't 2025)
- Rodriguez v. BSREP UA Heritage LLC, 181 A.D.3d 537, 538 (1st Dep't 2020)
- Rivas v. Panama Leasing, LLC, 238 A.D.3d 549, 549-550 (1st Dep't 2025)
- Hill v. Acies Group, LLC, 122 A.D.3d 428, 429 (1st Dep't 2014)

---

Retrieved from lawtools.ai · <https://lawtools.ai/cases/state/new-york-supreme-court-appellate-division-first-department-supreme-court-of-the-state-of-new-york-ap/2026/fields-v-junius-liberty-dev-llc-dfdnxris>