

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY

North Jersey Neurosurgical Associates PA v. Horizon Blue Cross Blue Shield of New Jersey

North Jersey Neurosurgical · No. Civil Action No. 25-12593 (SDW) (MAH) · Decided December 18, 2025

SUMMARY

The United States District Court for the District of New Jersey dismissed with prejudice North Jersey Neurosurgical Associates PA’s action seeking recovery of Independent Dispute Resolution awards under the No Surprises Act. The court concluded that it lacked jurisdiction, relying on Modern Orthopaedics of New Jersey v. Premera Blue Cross, and denied both Horizon’s motion to dismiss and the plaintiff’s cross-motion to confirm the arbitration award.

CASE DETAILS

|                       |                                                                                                                                                                                       |
|-----------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| COURT                 | United States District Court for the District of New Jersey                                                                                                                           |
| WRITING FOR THE COURT | Susan D. Wigenton                                                                                                                                                                     |
| JURISDICTION          | United States District Court for the District of New Jersey                                                                                                                           |
| DECIDED               | December 18, 2025                                                                                                                                                                     |
| DOCKET                | Civil Action No. 25-12593 (SDW) (MAH)                                                                                                                                                 |
| DISPOSITION           | dismissed                                                                                                                                                                             |
| PROCEDURAL POSTURE    | Defendant moved to dismiss the complaint, and Plaintiff cross-moved to confirm arbitration awards arising from Independent Dispute Resolution proceedings under the No Surprises Act. |
| PRECEDENTIAL VALUE    | unpublished                                                                                                                                                                           |

TOPICS

- subject matter jurisdiction
- motions to dismiss
- arbitration
- health law
- insurance

PRACTICE AREAS

- civil procedure
- health law
- insurance

QUESTIONS PRESENTED

1. Whether the district court had subject matter jurisdiction over Plaintiff's claims seeking recovery and confirmation of Independent Dispute Resolution awards issued under the No Surprises Act.

**HOLDINGS**

- 1. The district court lacked jurisdiction over the action.
- 2. Because the court lacked jurisdiction, Defendant's motion to dismiss and Plaintiff's cross-motion to confirm the arbitration award were denied, and Plaintiff's complaint was dismissed with prejudice.

**KEY QUOTATIONS**

- “for the reasons so cogently expressed in Modern Orthopaedics of New Jersey v. Premera Blue Cross, No. 25-1087, 2025 WL 3063648 (D.N.J. Nov. 3, 2025), this Court concludes it lacks jurisdiction over the instant matter”*
- “therefore Defendant’s MTD and Plaintiff’s Cross-Motion are DENIED and Plaintiff’s Complaint is DISMISSED WITH PREJUDICE.”*

**FACTUAL BACKGROUND**

North Jersey Neurosurgical Associates PA sought to recover \$299,232.67 in Independent Dispute Resolution awards issued on August 28, September 4 and 11, and October 11, 2024. The awards arose from proceedings under the No Surprises Act, 42 U.S.C. § 300gg-111 et seq. Plaintiff filed suit to recover the awards, while Horizon moved to dismiss and Plaintiff cross-moved to confirm them.

**PROCEDURAL HISTORY**

Plaintiff filed the action on July 2, 2025, seeking recovery of \$299,232.67 in Independent Dispute Resolution awards. Defendant moved to dismiss, and Plaintiff filed a cross-motion to confirm the arbitration award. The district court concluded that it lacked jurisdiction, denied both motions, and dismissed the complaint with prejudice.

**DISPOSITION**

dismissed

**CASES CITED**

- Modern Orthopaedics of New Jersey v. Premera Blue Cross, 2025 WL 3063648 (D.N.J. Nov. 3, 2025)

**OPINION**

NOT FOR PUBLICATION UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY NORTH JERSEY NEUROSURGICAL Civil Action No. 25-12593 (SDW) (MAH) ASSOCIATES PA, Plaintiff, WHEREAS OPINION & ORDER v. December 18, 2025 HORIZON BLUE CROSS BLUE SHIELD OF NEW JERSEY, Defendant. WIGENTON, District Judge. THIS MATTER having come before this Court upon Defendant Horizon Blue Cross Blue Shield of New Jersey’s (“Defendant”) Motion to Dismiss (D.E.

7 (“MTD”)) Plaintiff North Jersey Neurosurgical Associates PA’s (“Plaintiff”) Complaint (D.E. 1 (“Compl.”)) and Plaintiff’s Cross- Motion to Confirm an Arbitration Award (D.E. 11); and WHEREAS Plaintiff initiated the instant lawsuit on July 2, 2025, asserting claims pursuant to and for violation of the No Surprises Act, 42 U.S.C. § 300gg-111 et seq. (Compl. at 9–11.)

Plaintiff seeks to recover \$299,232.67 in Independent Dispute Resolution (“IDR”) awards issued following IDR proceedings on August 28, 2024; September 4 and 11, 2024; and October 11, 2024. (Id. ¶¶ 78, 82); and WHEREAS for the reasons so cogently expressed in *Modern Orthopaedics of New Jersey v. Premiera Blue Cross*, No. 25-1087, 2025 WL 3063648 (D.N.J. Nov. 3, 2025), this Court concludes it lacks jurisdiction over the instant matter; therefore Defendant’s MTD and Plaintiff’s Cross-Motion are DENIED and Plaintiff’s Complaint is DISMISSED WITH PREJUDICE.

SO ORDERED. \_\_\_\_/s/ Susan D. Wigenton\_\_\_\_\_ SUSAN D. WIGENTON, U.S.D.J. Orig: Clerk  
cc: Parties Michael A. Hammer, U.S.M.J.