

SUPREME COURT OF MINNESOTA

Tamara Monaghan v. Steve Simon, Minnesota Secretary of State

A16-1252 · No. A16-1252 · Decided September 8, 2016

SUMMARY

The Minnesota Supreme Court held that Robert Barrett was constitutionally ineligible to hold the office of State Representative for Legislative District 32B because he would not have resided in the district for the required six months before the November 8, 2016 election. The court denied the request to remove Barrett's name from the general-election ballot, concluding that Minnesota law instead required the resulting vacancy in nomination to be addressed through a special election. The court ordered that Barrett's name remain on the ballot, that vote totals not be certified, and that a special election be held on February 14, 2017.

CASE DETAILS

COURT	Supreme Court of Minnesota
JURISDICTION	Minnesota
DECIDED	September 8, 2016
DOCKET	A16-1252
DISPOSITION	other
PROCEDURAL POSTURE	Petition under Minn. Stat. § 204B.44 seeking to remove a partisan legislative candidate from the general-election ballot based on an alleged failure to satisfy the Minnesota Constitution's six-month legislative-district residency requirement.
STANDARD OF REVIEW	The Supreme Court independently adopted the referee's factual findings after an evidentiary hearing; the order states that the residency determination was established by clear and convincing evidence.
PRECEDENTIAL VALUE	published
PARTIES	Tamara Monaghan v. Steve Simon, Minnesota Secretary of State

TOPICS

[election contests](#)[ballot access](#)[election administration](#)[election law](#)[appellate procedure](#)

PRACTICE AREAS

QUESTIONS PRESENTED

1. Whether Robert Barrett was constitutionally ineligible to run for State Representative in Legislative District 32B because he would not have resided in the district for six months immediately preceding the November 8, 2016 election.
2. Whether the Minnesota Supreme Court could remove Barrett's name from the 2016 general-election ballot after determining that he was ineligible.
3. What statutory procedures apply when a major-party candidate for a partisan office is declared ineligible less than 79 days before the general election.

HOLDINGS

1. Barrett was ineligible to hold the office of State Representative for Legislative District 32B because he would not have resided in that district for the six months preceding the November 8, 2016 general election.
2. The court denied the request to remove Barrett's name from the 2016 general-election ballot because Minnesota law did not provide for removal under these circumstances.
3. Because the vacancy in nomination occurred fewer than 79 days before the general election, Barrett's name was to remain on the ballot, vote totals for the office were not to be certified, and the office was to be filled at a special election on February 14, 2017.

KEY QUOTATIONS

"A candidate who has not resided in the legislative district for six months immediately preceding the ... election is not qualified to run for state legislative office in that district." (at 1)

"Minnesota law does not provide for the removal of a candidate's name from the ballot in the circumstances present in this case." (at 2)

"If a vacancy in nomination 'occurs after the 79th day before the general election,' the general election ballot remains unchanged, and the county and state canvassing boards 'must not certify the vote totals for that office from the general election.'" (at 2)

FACTUAL BACKGROUND

Robert Barrett was the nominee of a major political party for State Representative in Legislative District 32B. His affidavit of candidacy listed a Taylors Falls address in District 32B, but the referee found that he did not reside in the district from approximately July 4 through August 1, 2016. Because that period fell within the six months preceding the November 8, 2016 general election, the court concluded that Barrett would not satisfy the constitutional residency requirement.

PROCEDURAL HISTORY

Monaghan filed the petition on August 5, 2016. The court appointed George T. Stephenson as referee, and an evidentiary hearing was held on August 19, 2016. The referee found by clear and convincing evidence that Robert Barrett did not reside in Legislative District 32B from approximately July 4 through August 1, 2016, and recommended granting the petition. After objections and memoranda from the parties, the Supreme Court held a hearing on September 6, 2016, adopted the referee's findings, declared Barrett ineligible to hold the office, but denied the requested removal of his name from the 2016 ballot.

DISPOSITION

other

REMAND INSTRUCTIONS

No remand. The Secretary of State was ordered to keep Barrett's name on the 2016 general-election ballot, notify the county and state canvassing boards not to certify the vote totals for the office, and prepare and distribute the required notice to affected county auditors.

CASES CITED

- Studer v. Kiffmeyer, 712 N.W.2d 552, 557 (Minn. 2006)

OPINION

PER CURIAM.

STATE OF MINNESOTA September 8, 2016 IN SUPREME COURT Om:Cf! OF
AJIIB.LIECcuns A16-1252 Tamara Monaghan, Petitioner, vs. Steve Simon, Minnesota Secretary
of State, Respondent. ORDER On August 5, 2016, Tamara Monaghan filed a petition under Minn.
Stat. § 204B.44 (Supp. 20 15), asking the court to remove the name of candidate Robert Barrett
from the ballot for the November 8, 2016 general election for the office of State Representative for
Legislative District 32B.

Petitioner alleges that candidate Barrett will not have resided in District 32B for 6 months
immediately preceding the November 8, 2016 general election, as required by Minn. Const. art.
IV, § 6. As directed by an order of this court, candidate Barrett filed a response in opposition to the
petition. An evidentiary hearing was held on August 19, 2016, before the Honorable George T.
Stephenson, acting as referee by order of this court.

Judge Stephenson filed his amended findings of fact on August 26, 2016, recommending that the
petition be granted. Candidate Barrett filed written objections to the amended findings of fact and
an informal memorandum on August 30, 2016. Petitioner and 1 respondent Steve Simon, the
Minnesota Secretary of State, also filed memoranda in response to the referee's amended findings
of fact.

At the hearing held before this court on September 6, 2016, petitioner asked the court to adopt the referee's recommendation and direct the Secretary of State to remove Barrett's name from the ballot. Candidate Barrett's affidavit of candidacy, filed with the Secretary of State on May 31, 2016, lists his residence as an address in Taylors Falls, Minnesota that is located in District 32B.

Petitioner contends that candidate Barrett owns a house in a district other than 32B and alleges that candidate Barrett will not have resided at the District-32B address during the 6 months before the November 8, 2016 general election.

The referee concluded that petitioner had proven by clear and convincing evidence that candidate Barrett did not reside in District 32B from approximately July 4, 2016 to August 1, 2016, and that, as a result, petitioner had proven that candidate Barrett had not resided in District 32B during the 6 months preceding the November 8, 2016 election.

We adopt the findings of the referee and consequently conclude that candidate Barrett will not be a resident of District 32B for the 6 months prior to November 8, 2016. "A candidate who has not resided in the legislative district for six months immediately preceding the... election is not qualified to run for state legislative office in that district." *Studer v. Kiffmeyer*, 712 N.W.2d 552, 557 (Minn.

2006). Petitioner asks the court to remove the name of candidate Barrett from the ballot for the November 8, 2016 general election for the office of State Representative for Legislative District 32B. Minnesota law does not provide for the removal of a candidate's name from the ballot in the circumstances present in this case. Candidate Barrett is the nominee of a 2 major political party for a partisan office.

An order from this court declaring candidate Barrett to be ineligible to hold the office he seeks creates a vacancy in nomination that invokes the procedures in Minn. Stat. § 204B.13 (2014 & Supp. 2015). A vacancy in nomination for a partisan office exists when a major political party candidate "is determined to be ineligible to hold the office the candidate is seeking, pursuant to a court order issued under section 204B.44." Minn. Stat. § 204B.13, subd.

1(a)(3) (Supp. 2015). If a vacancy in nomination "occurs after the 79th day before the general election," the general election ballot remains unchanged, and the county and state canvassing boards "must not certify the vote totals for that office from the general election." Minn. Stat. § 204B.13, subd. 2(c) (Supp. 2015). Instead, "the office must be filled at a special election held" in "February of the year following the year the vacancy in nomination occurred."

Minn. Stat. § 204B.13, subds. 2(c) (Supp. 2015), 7 (2014). "[N]o later than seven days after the general election," the major political party may fill the vacancy in nomination "by filing one nomination certificate with the same official who received the affidavits of candidacy for that office." *I d.*, subd. 2(a), (c) (Supp. 2015).

Here, the vacancy in nomination that results from the determination that candidate Barrett does not meet the constitutional residency requirement occurs less than 79 days before the general election on November 8, 2016.

Under Minn. Stat. § 204B.13, the representative from District 32B must be selected at a special election that will be held on February 14, 2017. Based upon all the files, records and proceedings herein, 3 IT IS HEREBY ORDERED THAT: 1.

The petition of Tamara Monaghan is granted to the extent it seeks an order declaring that Robert Barrett is ineligible to hold the office of State Representative for Legislative District 32B because he will not have resided in that district for the 6 months preceding the November 8, 2016 general election.

The petition of Tamara Monaghan is denied to the extent it seeks an order declaring that Robert Barrett's name shall be removed from the 2016 general election ballot for the office of State Representative for District 32B. 2. Respondent Steve Simon shall keep Robert Barrett's name on the 2016 general election ballot for the office of State Representative for District 32B and shall inform the county and state canvassing boards that, pursuant to this Order, the vote totals for the office of State Representative for District 32B from the 2016 general election should not be certified.

3. Respondent Simon shall prepare and distribute to each affected county auditor the notice to voters that must be posted in precincts on election day under Minn. Stat. § 204B.13, subd. 2(c). 4. So as not to impair the orderly election process, this order is issued with opinion to follow. Dated: September 8, 2016 BY THE COURT: Lorie S. Gildea Chief Justice 4